

To: ALA/ ALCTS/CCS Committee on Cataloging: Description and Access
From: John Hostage, representative from American Association of Law Libraries (AALL)
Subject: Revision of RDA 16.2.2.9: Places in certain federations

Background and Recommendations

AALL agreed to look at RDA 16.2.2.9 and consider whether special instructions were needed for federations and whether they should be applied to all federations. We could find no empirical basis for deciding whether special instructions are needed. However, we reject an all-or-nothing approach in which the instruction for certain federations would either be eliminated or applied to all federations. It was easy to decide that the idea of applying the same instruction to all federations was untenable. Wikipedia lists 25 current federations in the world, including countries like Germany, India, and Nigeria, but of course it depends to some extent on how one defines a federation. In any case, we can't imagine expecting catalogers to identify the state or other subdivision in which places in all these countries are located, nor can we see how it would serve the user.

The practice in AACR and RDA of treating places in certain federations under a special instruction seems to be based on customs and traditions and pragmatic considerations. In the United States, place names are almost always associated with the name of the state in which they are located. It should probably be left to representatives from Australia and Canada to say how much place names in those countries are associated with the name of the state or province, but we saw no reason to change the long-standing cataloging practice for those countries.

Among the federations listed in 16.2.2.9 that still exist, Malaysia is the only one not represented among the authors of RDA and its predecessor AACR. Given the history of that country and the fact that the federation was formed in 1963 and Singapore withdrew two years later, it may have seemed prudent in the 1970s to give primacy to the states of Malaysia. However, several decades later, it seems safe to say that most catalog users outside that country are not familiar with the 13 states and three federal territories of Malaysia and are not well served by access points like *George Town (Penang)* or *Ipoh (Perak)*. This fact is recognized by LCRI 23.4C, which calls for a reference from the name qualified by "(Malaysia)". Therefore, we are recommending that Malaysia be removed from the instructions in 16.2.2.9 and be treated under the instruction for places in other jurisdictions.

The U.S.S.R. and Yugoslavia no longer exist. For most purposes, they don't need to be mentioned in these instructions because the name that is recorded would be the same both before and after they ceased to exist. Moreover, LCPS for 16.4.2 says to use the current name of the larger place as a qualifier. So the only reason to retain the U.S.S.R. and Yugoslavia in 16.2.2.9 is to provide guidance to the cataloger when describing resources from the period when those federations existed. However, the instructions should acknowledge that they no longer exist, so we propose adding "the former" to the instructions.

We believe there should be a general instruction for overseas territories and insular areas. This lack is recognized by LCPS for 16.2.2.4, Islands and Island Groups. Without such an instruction, one has to infer a rule for examples like *Papeete (French Polynesia)*, since French Polynesia is not a country. One also has to infer that the names of overseas territories like French Polynesia do not have the name of the country, e.g. (*France*), added to them. This instruction would also clarify the application of 16.2.2.9. The term *territory* in 16.2.2.9 should be understood as applying to territories that are integral parts of the country, such as the Nunavut territory in Canada or the Northern Territory in Australia. There is no reason why places in the U.S. Virgin Islands should be treated by one instruction (16.2.2.9.2) and places in the British Virgin Islands by another (16.2.2.11). We have used the term *insular area* in the proposed new 16.2.2.11 because it is a generic term used by the United States Office of Insular Affairs and defined at http://www.doi.gov/oia/Islandpages/political_types.htm.

In summary, our recommendations are to

- add “the former” to the U.S.S.R. and to Yugoslavia,
- create new instructions at 16.2.2.11 for overseas territories and insular areas,
- move examples for Guam and Puerto Rico from 16.2.2.9 to the new 16.2.2.11,
- remove Malaysia from 16.2.2.9,
- remove Malaysian examples from 16.2.2.9 and add them to 16.2.2.12 (formerly 16.2.2.11),
- add an example for Dakota Territory to 16.2.2.9.1 to show an example of an American territory,
- remove the example for Slovenia because it is now an independent country,
- move the examples for Kiev and Split from 16.2.2.9.2 to 16.2.2.12 (formerly 16.2.2.11) to reflect their current status.

N.B. In 16.2.2.11, there is an extraneous period after the word “located” that should be deleted. It has been reported on an RDA support ticket.

Proposed revisions: marked version

16.2.2.4 Recording the Preferred Name

-
- Record the name of a place in the form most commonly found in gazetteers or other reference sources used in choosing the name, unless the instructions given under [16.2.2.8–16.2.2.1314](#) indicate otherwise.
 - Record as part of the name of a place (other than a country or a state, etc., listed in [16.2.2.9.1](#), [16.2.2.10.1](#), or [16.2.2.11.1](#)) the name of the larger place in which it is located or the larger jurisdiction to which it belongs applying the instructions given under [16.2.2.9–16.2.2.1314](#).

- If the place name is being used as the conventional name for a government (see [11.2.2.5.4](#)), enclose the name of the larger place in parentheses.

Budapest (Hungary)

- If the place name is being used to record the location of a conference, etc., (see [11.3.2](#)), the location of the headquarters, etc., of a corporate body (see [11.3.3](#)), the place of origin of a work (see [6.5](#)), or a place associated with a person (see [9.8-9.11](#)), a family (see [10.5](#)), or a corporate body (see [11.3](#)), precede the name of the larger place by a comma.

Budapest, Hungary

Place name recorded as the location of the corporate body with the preferred name: Rumbach Utcai Zsinagóga)

16.2.2.9 **Places in Australia, Canada, Malaysia, the United States, the former U.S.S.R., or the former Yugoslavia**

Record the preferred name for a place in Australia, Canada, Malaysia, the United States, the former U.S.S.R., or the former Yugoslavia as instructed under [16.2.2.9.1](#) (states, provinces, territories, etc.) or [16.2.2.9.2](#) (places in a state, province, territory, etc.), as applicable.

16.2.2.9.1 **States, Provinces, Territories, Etc.**

- Do not record the name of the larger jurisdiction as part of the name of a state, province, territory, etc., of Australia, Canada, Malaysia, the United States, the former U.S.S.R., or the former Yugoslavia.

Northern Territory

Prince Edward Island

Sarawak

Oregon

District of Columbia

Guam

Puerto Rico

Azerbaijan S.S.R.

Slovenia

Dakota Territory

16.2.2.9.2**Places in a State, Province, Territory, Etc.**

- If the place is in a state, province, territory, etc., of one of the countries listed under [16.2.2.9.1](#), record the name of the state, etc., in which it is located as part of the name, applying the instructions given under [16.2.2.4](#). Abbreviate the name of the larger place as instructed in appendix [B \(B.2\)](#), as applicable.

Darwin (N.T.)

Jasper (Alta.)

Clayoquot Land District (B.C.)

~~Ipoh (Perak)~~

~~Kota Kinabalu (Sabah)~~

Cook County (Ill.)

Alexandria (Va.)

Latah Soil and Water Conservation District
(Idaho)

Washington (D.C.)

~~San Juan (P.R.)~~

~~Kiev (Ukraine)~~

~~Split (Croatia)~~

16.2.2.10 Places in the British Isles

Record the preferred name for a place in the British Isles as instructed under [16.2.2.10.1](#) (England, the Republic of Ireland, Northern Ireland, Scotland, Wales, the Isle of Man, and the Channel Islands) or [16.2.2.10.2](#) (other places), as applicable.

16.2.2.10.1**England, the Republic of Ireland, Northern Ireland, Scotland, Wales, the Isle of Man, and the Channel Islands**

- Do not record the name of the larger jurisdiction as part of the names of the following parts of the British Isles: England, the Republic of Ireland, Northern Ireland, Scotland, Wales, the Isle of Man, the Channel Islands.

England

Ireland

Isle of Man

16.2.2.10.2**Other Places**

- If a place is located in England, the Republic of Ireland, Northern Ireland, Scotland, Wales, the Isle of Man, or the Channel Islands, record *England, Ireland, Northern Ireland, Scotland, Wales, Isle of Man, or Channel Islands*, as appropriate, as part of the name, applying the instructions given under [16.2.2.4](#).

Dorset (England)

Waterville (Ireland)

Bangor (Northern Ireland)

Dumfries and Galloway (Scotland)

Powys (Wales)

Ramsey (Isle of Man)

Jersey (Channel Islands)

16.2.2.11**Places in Overseas Territories and Insular Areas**

Record the preferred name for a place in an overseas territory or insular area as instructed under [16.2.2.11.1](#) (overseas territories and insular areas) or [16.2.2.11.2](#) (places in an overseas territory or insular area), as applicable.

16.2.2.11.1**Overseas Territories and Insular Areas**

- Do not record the name of the larger jurisdiction as part of the name of an overseas territory or insular area.

Guam

Puerto Rico

Guadeloupe

French Polynesia

16.2.2.11.2**Places in an Overseas Territory or Insular Area**

- If the place is in an overseas territory or insular area, record the name of the overseas territory or insular area in which it is located as part of the name, applying the instructions given under [16.2.2.4](#). Abbreviate the name of the larger place as instructed in Appendix [B \(B.2\)](#), as applicable.

San Juan (P.R.)

Spanish Town (V.I.)

Papeete (French Polynesia)

16.2.2.112 **Places in Other Jurisdictions**

- For places in jurisdictions not covered by [16.2.2.9](#) (places in Australia, Canada, ~~Malaysia~~, the United States, ~~the former~~ U.S.S.R., or ~~the former~~ Yugoslavia), or [16.2.2.10](#) (places in the British Isles), or [16.2.2.11](#) (places in overseas territories or insular areas), record the name of the country in which the place is located, as part of the name of the place. Abbreviate the name of the country as instructed in appendix [B \(B.2\)](#), as applicable.

Formosa (Argentina)

Maputo (Mozambique)

Lucca (Italy)

Queenstown-Lakes District (N.Z.)

Madras (India)

Palawan (Philippines)

Region Sjælland (Denmark)

Paris (France)

~~Spanish Town (V.I.)~~

~~Papeete (French Polynesia)~~

Far North Province (Cameroon)

Ipoh (Malaysia)

Kota Kinabalu (Malaysia)

Sarawak (Malaysia)

Kiev (Ukraine)

Split (Croatia)

16.2.2.1213 **Places with the Same Name**

- If recording the name of the larger place or jurisdiction as part of the name as instructed in [16.2.2.9-16.2.2.112](#) is insufficient to distinguish between two or more places with the same name, include as part of the name of the place a word or phrase commonly used to distinguish them.

Alhama de Almería (Spain)

Short form of name: Alhama. **Fuller form of name recorded to distinguish the place from other places with the same name**

Alhama de Granada (Spain)

Short form of name: Alhama. **Fuller form of name recorded to distinguish the place from other places with the same name**

- If there is no such word or phrase, record the name of an appropriate smaller place before the name of the larger place.

Friedberg (Bavaria, Germany)

Friedberg (Hesse, Germany)

Tarbert (Argyll and Bute, Scotland)

Tarbert (Western Isles, Scotland)

Farnham (Dorset, England)

Farnham (Essex, England)

Oakdale (Stearns County, Minn.)

Oakdale (Washington County, Minn.)

16.2.2.1314 **Places within Cities, Etc.**

- When recording the name of a place within a city, etc., record the name of the city, etc., and the larger place within which the city, etc., is located, as prescribed in the instructions given under [16.2.2.9-16.2.2.1213](#).

Hyde Park (Chicago, Ill.)

Chelsea (London, England)

Tamaki (Auckland, N.Z.)

Las Condes (Santiago, Chile)

Cabbagetown (Toronto, Ont.)

Quartier latin (Paris, France)

Minato-ku (Tokyo, Japan)

Art Deco Historic District (Miami Beach, Fla.)

Clean version

16.2.2.4 Recording the Preferred Name

- Record the name of a place in the form most commonly found in gazetteers or other reference sources used in choosing the name, unless the instructions given under [16.2.2.8–16.2.2.14](#) indicate otherwise.
- Record as part of the name of a place (other than a country or a state, etc., listed in [16.2.2.9.1](#), [16.2.2.10.1](#), or [16.2.2.11.1](#)) the name of the larger place in which it is located or the larger jurisdiction to which it belongs applying the instructions given under [16.2.2.9–16.2.2.14](#).
- If the place name is being used as the conventional name for a government (see [11.2.2.5.4](#)), enclose the name of the larger place in parentheses.

Budapest (Hungary)

- If the place name is being used to record the location of a conference, etc., (see [11.3.2](#)), the location of the headquarters, etc., of a corporate body (see [11.3.3](#)), the place of origin of a work (see [6.5](#)), or a place associated with a person (see [9.8–9.11](#)), a family (see [10.5](#)), or a corporate body (see [11.3](#)), precede the name of the larger place by a comma.

Budapest, Hungary

Place name recorded as the location of the corporate body with the preferred name: Rumbach Utcai Zsinagóga)

16.2.2.9 Places in Australia, Canada, the United States, the former U.S.S.R., or the former Yugoslavia

Record the preferred name for a place in Australia, Canada, the United States, the former U.S.S.R., or the former Yugoslavia as instructed under [16.2.2.9.1](#) (states, provinces, territories, etc.) or [16.2.2.9.2](#) (places in a state, province, territory, etc.), as applicable.

16.2.2.9.1 States, Provinces, Territories, Etc.

- Do not record the name of the larger jurisdiction as part of the name of a state, province, territory, etc., of Australia, Canada, the United States, the former U.S.S.R., or the former Yugoslavia.

Northern Territory

Prince Edward Island

Oregon

District of Columbia

Azerbaijan S.S.R.

Dakota Territory

16.2.2.9.2

Places in a State, Province, Territory, Etc.

- If the place is in a state, province, territory, etc., of one of the countries listed under [16.2.2.9.1](#), record the name of the state, etc., in which it is located as part of the name, applying the instructions given under [16.2.2.4](#). Abbreviate the name of the larger place as instructed in appendix [B \(B.2\)](#), as applicable.

Darwin (N.T.)

Jasper (Alta.)

Clayoquot Land District (B.C.)

Cook County (Ill.)

Alexandria (Va.)

Latah Soil and Water Conservation District
(Idaho)

Washington (D.C.)

16.2.2.10

Places in the British Isles

Record the preferred name for a place in the British Isles as instructed under [16.2.2.10.1](#) (England, the Republic of Ireland, Northern Ireland, Scotland, Wales, the Isle of Man, and the Channel Islands) or [16.2.2.10.2](#) (other places), as applicable.

16.2.2.10.1

England, the Republic of Ireland, Northern Ireland, Scotland, Wales, the Isle of Man, and the Channel Islands

- Do not record the name of the larger jurisdiction as part of the names of the following parts of the British Isles: England, the Republic of Ireland, Northern Ireland, Scotland, Wales, the Isle of Man, the Channel Islands.

England

Ireland

Isle of Man

16.2.2.10.2

Other Places

- If a place is located in England, the Republic of Ireland, Northern Ireland, Scotland, Wales, the Isle of Man, or the Channel Islands, record *England, Ireland, Northern Ireland, Scotland, Wales, Isle of*

Man, or Channel Islands, as appropriate, as part of the name, applying the instructions given under [16.2.2.4](#).

Dorset (England)

Waterville (Ireland)

Bangor (Northern Ireland)

Dumfries and Galloway (Scotland)

Powys (Wales)

Ramsey (Isle of Man)

Jersey (Channel Islands)

16.2.2.11 Places in Overseas Territories and Insular Areas

Record the preferred name for a place in an overseas territory or insular area as instructed under [16.2.2.11.1](#) (overseas territories and insular areas) or [16.2.2.11.2](#) (places in an overseas territory or insular area), as applicable.

16.2.2.11.1 Overseas Territories and Insular Areas

- Do not record the name of the larger jurisdiction as part of the name of an overseas territory or insular area.

Guam

Puerto Rico

Guadeloupe

French Polynesia

16.2.2.11.2 Places in an Overseas Territory or Insular Area

- If the place is in an overseas territory or insular area, record the name of the overseas territory or insular area in which it is located as part of the name, applying the instructions given under [16.2.2.4](#). Abbreviate the name of the larger place as instructed in Appendix [B \(B.2\)](#), as applicable.

San Juan (P.R.)

Spanish Town (V.I.)

Papeete (French Polynesia)

16.2.2.12 Places in Other Jurisdictions

- For places in jurisdictions not covered by [16.2.2.9](#) (places in Australia,

Canada, the United States, the former U.S.S.R., or the former Yugoslavia), [16.2.2.10](#) (places in the British Isles), or [16.2.2.11](#) (places in overseas territories or insular areas), record the name of the country in which the place is located, as part of the name of the place.

Abbreviate the name of the country as instructed in appendix [B \(B.2\)](#), as applicable.

Formosa (Argentina)

Maputo (Mozambique)

Lucca (Italy)

Queenstown-Lakes District (N.Z.)

Madras (India)

Palawan (Philippines)

Region Sjælland (Denmark)

Paris (France)

Far North Province (Cameroon)

Ipoh (Malaysia)

Kota Kinabalu (Malaysia)

Sarawak (Malaysia)

Kiev (Ukraine)

Split (Croatia)

16.2.2.13 Places with the Same Name

- If recording the name of the larger place or jurisdiction as part of the name as instructed in [16.2.2.9–16.2.2.12](#) is insufficient to distinguish between two or more places with the same name, include as part of the name of the place a word or phrase commonly used to distinguish them.

Alhama de Almería (Spain)

Short form of name: Alhama. **Fuller form of name recorded to distinguish the place from other places with the same name**

Alhama de Granada (Spain)

Short form of name: Alhama. **Fuller form of name recorded to distinguish the place from other places with the same name**

- If there is no such word or phrase, record the name of an appropriate smaller place before the name of the larger place.

Friedberg (Bavaria, Germany)

Friedberg (Hesse, Germany)
Tarbert (Argyll and Bute, Scotland)
Tarbert (Western Isles, Scotland)
Farnham (Dorset, England)
Farnham (Essex, England)
Oakdale (Stearns County, Minn.)
Oakdale (Washington County, Minn.)

16.2.2.14 **Places within Cities, Etc.**

- When recording the name of a place within a city, etc., record the name of the city, etc., and the larger place within which the city, etc., is located, as prescribed in the instructions given under [16.2.2.9-16.2.2.13](#).

Hyde Park (Chicago, Ill.)
Chelsea (London, England)
Tamaki (Auckland, N.Z.)
Las Condes (Santiago, Chile)
Cabbagetown (Toronto, Ont.)
Quartier latin (Paris, France)
Minato-ku (Tokyo, Japan)
Art Deco Historic District (Miami Beach, Fla.)