

To: ALA/ALCTS/CCS Committee on Cataloging: Description and Access

From: Mark Scharff, Music Library Association liaison to CC:DA

Subject: Changes to *RDA* Chapter 2 related to status of container as a source for description and to preference for collective title

The Bibliographic Control Committee of the Music Library Association requests CC:DA's endorsement of these proposed revisions to the text of *Resource Description and Access (RDA)*. We ask for your consideration and endorsement at the 2011 ALA Annual Meeting so that the proposal may be considered by the Joint Steering Committee at its November meeting. The proposals incorporate suggestions from members of OLAC's Cataloging Policy Committee (CAPC).

The proposals are presented together because they are closely related. Proposal 1 establishes a collective title as the preferred means for identifying a resource as a whole; Proposal 2 clarifies the status of the container and accompanying textual material as potential preferred sources when they bear a collective title that the usual preferred source for a sound recording or moving-image resource does not.

## PROPOSAL 1

Revise *RDA* 2.1.2.2 to prefer a collective title in a resource as identifying the resource as a whole. The situation that MLA's proposal addresses is that of a resource that

- embodies multiple works,
- has a preferred source bearing the titles of the works it embodies, but not a collective title
- has a collective title on the container or in the accompanying textual material. (See Appendix A for an example of such a resource.)

### Background

Non-print library materials, and sound and video recordings in particular, not infrequently have a preferred source of information that contains not a collective title for the resource, but a list of titles of works embodied in the resource.

For items lacking a collective title, *AACR2* 1.1G3 directs:

If describing the item as a unit, transcribe the titles of the individually titled works in the order in which they appear in the chief source of information or, if there is no single chief source of information, in the order in which they appear in the item, treating multiple sources of information as if they were one source (see [1.0A3 AACR2](#)).

*RDA* has a corresponding instruction (2.3.2.9, in part):

### **2.3.2.9 Resource Lacking a Collective Title**

When preparing a comprehensive description for a resource that lacks a collective title, record the titles proper of the parts as they appear on the source of information for the resource as a whole.

*[Examples omitted]*

If the sources of information identifying the individual parts are being treated as a collective source of information for the resource as a whole (see [2.1.2 RDA](#)), record the titles proper of the parts in the order in which they appear in the resource.

*[Examples omitted]*

*Alternative*

Devise a title applying the instructions given under [2.3.2.11 RDA](#).

*[Additional instruction omitted]*

In *AACR2*, rule 6.0B1, in identifying the chief source of information for sound recordings, said:

Treat accompanying textual material or a container as the chief source of information if it furnishes a collective title and the parts themselves and their labels do not. In this case, make a note (see [6.7B3 AACR2](#)) indicating the source of information.

While this might appear to be an example of “case law,” there is an underlying principle that regards a collective title as more usefully “identifying the resource as a whole” than does a string of titles of works embodied in the resource.

*RDA*’s basic principle is stated in 2.1.2.2:

### **2.1.2.2 Resource Issued as a Single Unit**

When preparing a comprehensive description for a resource issued as a single unit (e.g., a textbook in one volume), choose a source of information identifying the resource as a whole.

If there is no source of information identifying the resource as a whole (e.g., a single videodisc containing multiple feature films but with no source of information identifying the resource as a whole), treat the sources of information identifying its individual contents as a collective source of information for the resource as a whole.

*RDA* gives these instructions for determining a preferred source of information for moving-image material:

### **2.2.2.3 Resources Consisting of Moving Images**

If the resource consists of moving images (e.g., a film reel, a videodisc, a video game, an MPEG video file), use the title frame or frames, or title screen or screens, as the preferred source of information.

#### *Alternative*

Use an eye-readable label bearing a title that is permanently printed on or affixed to the resource (excluding accompanying textual material or a container) in preference to the title frame or frames, or title screen or screens.

If the resource does not contain a title frame or title screen, use as the preferred source of information, as applicable:

#### ***either***

- a) a label bearing a title that is permanently printed on or affixed to the resource, excluding accompanying textual material or a container (e.g., a label on a videodisc)

#### ***or***

- b) embedded metadata in textual form that contains a title (e.g., metadata embedded in an MPEG video file).

If the resource contains neither a title frame or title screen nor a source of information falling into category a) or b) above, use as the preferred source of information another source forming part of the resource itself, giving preference to sources in which the information is formally presented.

The instructions for sound recordings are more generalized (2.2.2.4, Other Resources):

### **2.2.2.4 Other Resources**

For a resource other than one covered under [2.2.2.2 RDA](#)—[2.2.2.3 RDA](#), use as the preferred source of information, as applicable:

#### ***either***

- a) a label bearing a title that is permanently printed on or affixed to the resource, excluding accompanying textual material or a container (e.g., a label on an audio CD or a model)

#### ***or***

- b) embedded metadata in textual form that contains a title (e.g., metadata embedded in an MP3 audio file).

If the resource does not contain a source of information falling into either category a) or b) above, use as the preferred source of information another source forming part of the resource itself, giving preference to sources in which the information is formally presented.

Point a), in excluding accompanying textual material or a container from eligibility as the preferred source of information, has an impact on this proposal, but will be dealt with later in this document.

Our problem is that the instructions refer to *the source of information* as “identifying the resource as a whole,” not distinguishing between a single collective titles and a string of work titles. For the materials under discussion, because the string of titles *does* “[identify] the resource as a whole,” the instruction offers no choice but to accept the label (cf. *RDA* 2.2.2.4) as the preferred source of information, which then leads to the transcription directed in 2.3.2.9. Any notion that the current text supports consideration of a collective title to trump a string of titles in “identifying the resource as a whole” is refuted by the next sentence of 2.1.2.2, which specifically refers to “sources” being treated as a “collective source of information.” That language also appears in 2.3.2.9.

### **Rationale**

Music and A/V catalogers invoke *AACR2* 6.0B1 frequently to produce a title proper that is closer to what a user might think the resource to be named, or that reflects what the producer or publisher of the resource considers the title to be. This aligns with the aims expressed in *RDA* 2.0, second paragraph:

The elements reflect the information typically used by the producers of resources to identify their products—title, statement of responsibility, edition statement, etc. The same elements are those that a user will most frequently rely on to determine whether the resource described is the one sought, or to distinguish between resources bearing similar identifying information.

Moving the titles of works to a contents note often allows them to be linked more explicitly to other data about the work as performed (e.g. names of performers, timings, clarifying information that can be presented as bracketed interpolations). Having a shorter title proper produces cleaner browse displays.

MLA recognizes that the last two considerations are out of scope for *RDA*, with its display-neutral stance. Nonetheless, incorporating the principle of a collective title as being the preferred means of “identifying the resource as a whole” would more fully satisfy the *RDA* principles of Sufficiency and Representation.

## Assessment of impact

The impact of this change will not be large in terms of change in practice for sound recording catalogers, at least as viewed through the lens of *RDA*'s objective of Continuity (0.4.2.4). Since there was no equivalent for 6.0B1 in *AACR2* Chapter 7 for motion pictures and video recordings, this change might be more significant for that community. However, consultation with members of OLAC suggests that catalogers have been preferring sources with collective titles anyway; our proposed change will represent continuity. While we can be less sure of the impact on the cataloging of other sorts of materials, it seems unlikely that a practice that presents a title that is usually closer to that a user would know is a bad thing.

## Proposed revision:

### **2.1 Basis for Identification of the Resource**

#### **2.1.1 General Guidelines**

[...]

#### **2.1.2 Comprehensive Description**

##### **2.1.2.1 General Guidelines**

[...]

##### **2.1.2.2 Resources Issued as a Single Unit**

When preparing a comprehensive description for a resource issued as a single unit (e.g., a textbook in one volume, a compact disc embodying multiple works), choose a source of information identifying the resource as a whole, preferring a source that presents a collective title.

If there is no source of information identifying the resource as a whole (e.g., a single videodisc containing multiple feature films but with no source of information identifying the resource as a whole), treat the sources of information identifying its individual contents as a collective source of information for the resource as a whole.

## Clean copy:

### **2.1 Basis for Identification of the Resource**

#### **2.1.1 General Guidelines**

[...]

#### **2.1.2 Comprehensive Description**

##### **2.1.2.1 General Guidelines**

[...]

### 2.1.2.2 Resources Issued as a Single Unit

When preparing a comprehensive description for a resource issued as a single unit (e.g., a textbook in one volume, a compact disc embodying multiple works), choose a source of information identifying the resource as a whole, preferring a source that presents a collective title.

If there is no source of information identifying the resource as a whole (e.g., a single videodisc containing multiple feature films but with no source of information identifying the resource as a whole), treat the sources of information identifying its individual contents as a collective source of information for the resource as a whole.

## PROPOSAL 2

Clarify the status of a container issued by the publisher as being part of the resource.

### Background

As presented above, *AACR2* 6.0B1 instructed the cataloger to use accompanying textual material or the container (sleeve, box) as the chief source of information if the otherwise preferred source did not furnish a collective title. *AACR2* Chapter 7 had no such provision, and drew a clear distinction between containers integral to the piece (such as the housing of a videocassette tape) and those that were not (e.g. the publisher's cardboard sleeve in which a videocassette might be sold).

*RDA*, in the General Guidelines for Preferred Sources of Information (2.2.2.1), says:

### 2.2.2 Preferred Sources of Information

#### 2.2.2.1 General Guidelines

Use as the preferred source of information a source forming part of the resource itself that is appropriate to:

a) the type of description (see [2.1 RDA](#))

**and**

b) the presentation format of the resource (see [2.2.2.2 RDA](#)—[2.2.2.4 RDA](#)).

When choosing a preferred source of information, treat both the storage medium (e.g., paper, tape, film) and any housing (e.g., a cassette, a cartridge) that is an integral part of the resource as part of the resource itself.

Treat accompanying material as part of the resource itself when describing the resource as a whole using a comprehensive

description. When preparing an analytical description of one or more components of a resource, treat accompanying material as a source outside the resource itself (i.e., as a related resource).

Treat a container such as a box in which a game or kit is issued as part of the resource itself. Treat a container that is not issued as part of the resource (e.g., a box or case made by the owner) as a source outside the resource itself.

*[Additional instructions omitted]*

A cataloger trying to determine whether a container such as a jewel case containing two compact discs, a box containing three such cases and a booklet, or a cardboard sleeve surrounding ten jewel cases is part of the resource itself could get confused.

The first paragraph of the instruction quoted above gives the type of description and the format presentation as the two determinants of this. The instruction for choosing a preferred source of information when preparing a comprehensive description (2.1.2) has been quoted above. The third paragraph of 2.2.2.1 explicitly affirms that accompanying material (e.g. a booklet inserted in the lid of a jewel case) is considered part of the resource in such a description.

The next paragraph is the first source of confusion. The intent seems to be to distinguish between containers issued by the publisher of the resource vs. those created subsequent to publication by another agency. But that is not presented as a positive condition; only its opposite is spelled out in the second sentence. And the example given in the first sentence illustrates a relatively minor subset of such material. These two editorial decisions create needless uncertainty.

The second determinant for sound recordings and moving-image materials is given in 2.2.2.4, also quoted above. It explicitly excludes accompanying textual material and containers from consideration as preferred sources of information for sound recordings; a similar statement is found in 2.2.2.3 for moving-image material.

### **Rationale**

As presented in Proposal 1, MLA would like to have a collective title presented within a resource be given preference as “identifying the resource as a whole.” But that is not quite enough. MLA would like the language in the fourth paragraph of 2.2.2.1 to specify that the distinction is between containers issued by the publisher and those that are not. A more mainstream example would be helpful, too.

MLA would also like to see the exclusion of accompanying textual material and container in 2.2.2.3 and 2.2.2.4 tempered so as to allow their use when they present a collective title not found elsewhere in the resource.

## Assessment of impact

Because the proposed changes to 2.2.2.1 merely make explicit what we think is the intent of the instruction, we see the only impact as being that of eliminating needless head-scratching. While our proposed exception to 2.2.2.3 and 2.2.2.4's exclusion of accompanying textual material and container from eligibility for preferred source of information might have a wider impact, it still seems to offer the benefit of favoring a title that will be more user-friendly.

### Proposed revision:

*(Some intervening instructions omitted; others retained to provide context)*

## 2.2 Sources of Information

### 2.2.1 Application

[...]

### 2.2.2 Preferred Source of Information

#### 2.2.2.1 General Guidelines

Use as the preferred source of information a source forming part of the resource itself that is appropriate to:

a) the type of description (see [2.1 RDA](#))

**and**

b) the presentation format of the resource (see [2.2.2.2 RDA](#)—[2.2.2.4 RDA](#)).

When choosing a preferred source of information, treat both the storage medium (e.g., paper, tape, film) and any housing (e.g., a cassette, a cartridge) that is an integral part of the resource as part of the resource itself.

Treat accompanying material as part of the resource itself when describing the resource as a whole using a comprehensive description. When preparing an analytical description of one or more components of a resource, treat accompanying material as a source outside the resource itself (i.e., as a related resource).

Treat a container issued by the publishing body (such as a box in which a game or kit is issued or a clamshell box containing compact discs in individual jewel cases or cardboard sleeves) as part of the resource itself. Treat a container that is not issued as part of the resource (e.g., a box or case made by the owner) as a source outside the resource itself.

*[Additional instructions omitted]*



#### **2.2.2.2 Resources Consisting of One or More Pages, Leaves, Sheets, or Cards (or Images of One or More Pages, Leaves, Sheets, or Cards)**

[...]

#### **2.2.2.3 Resources Consisting of Moving Images**

If the resource consists of moving images (e.g., a film reel, a videodisc, a video game, an MPEG video file), use the title frame or frames, or title screen or screens, as the preferred source of information.

If the preferred source does not bear a collective title, and a collective title is formally presented on another part of the resource, use that part as the preferred source of information.

##### *Alternative*

Use an eye-readable label bearing a title that is permanently printed on or affixed to the resource (excluding accompanying textual material or a container) in preference to the title frame or frames, or title screen or screens.

If the resource does not contain a title frame or title screen, use as the preferred source of information, as applicable:

##### ***either***

- a) a label bearing a title that is permanently printed on or affixed to the resource, excluding accompanying textual material or a container (e.g., a label on a videodisc)

##### ***or***

- b) embedded metadata in textual form that contains a title (e.g., metadata embedded in an MPEG video file).

If the resource contains neither a title frame or title screen nor a source of information falling into category a) or b) above, use as the preferred source of information another source forming part of the resource itself, giving preference to sources in which the information is formally presented.

#### **2.2.2.4 Other Resources**

For a resource other than one covered under [2.2.2.2 RDA](#)—[2.2.2.3 RDA](#), use as the preferred source of information, as applicable:

***either***

- a) a label bearing a title that is permanently printed on or affixed to the resource, excluding accompanying textual material or a container (e.g., a label on an audio CD or a model), unless they present a collective title not found elsewhere in the resource.

***or***

- b) embedded metadata in textual form that contains a title (e.g., metadata embedded in an MP3 audio file).

If the resource does not contain a source of information falling into either category a) or b) above, use as the preferred source of information another source forming part of the resource itself, giving preference to sources in which the information is formally presented.

**Clean copy:****2.2 Sources of Information****2.2.1 Application**

[...]

**2.2.2 Preferred Source of Information****2.2.2.1 General Guidelines**

Use as the preferred source of information a source forming part of the resource itself that is appropriate to:

- c) the type of description (see [2.1 RDA](#))

***and***

- d) the presentation format of the resource (see [2.2.2.2 RDA](#)—[2.2.2.4 RDA](#)).

When choosing a preferred source of information, treat both the storage medium (e.g., paper, tape, film) and any housing (e.g., a cassette, a cartridge) that is an integral part of the resource as part of the resource itself.

Treat accompanying material as part of the resource itself when describing the resource as a whole using a comprehensive description. When preparing an analytical description of one or more components of a resource, treat accompanying material as a source outside the resource itself (i.e., as a related resource).

Treat a container issued by the publishing body (such as a box in which a game or kit is issued or a clamshell box containing

compact discs in individual jewel cases or cardboard sleeves) as part of the resource itself. Treat a container that is not issued as part of the resource (e.g., a box or case made by the owner) as a source outside the resource itself.

[*Additional instructions omitted*]

#### **2.2.2.2 Resources Consisting of One or More Pages, Leaves, Sheets, or Cards (or Images of One or More Pages, Leaves, Sheets, or Cards)**

[...]

#### **2.2.2.3 Resources Consisting of Moving Images**

If the resource consists of moving images (e.g., a film reel, a videodisc, a video game, an MPEG video file), use the title frame or frames, or title screen or screens, as the preferred source of information.

If the preferred source does not bear a collective title, and a collective title is formally presented on another part of the resource, use that part as the preferred source of information.

##### *Alternative*

Use an eye-readable label bearing a title that is permanently printed on or affixed to the resource (excluding accompanying textual material or a container) in preference to the title frame or frames, or title screen or screens.

If the resource does not contain a title frame or title screen, use as the preferred source of information, as applicable:

##### ***either***

- a) a label bearing a title that is permanently printed on or affixed to the resource, excluding accompanying textual material or a container (e.g., a label on a videodisc)

##### ***or***

- b) embedded metadata in textual form that contains a title (e.g., metadata embedded in an MPEG video file).

If the resource contains neither a title frame or title screen nor a source of information falling into category a) or b) above, use as the preferred source of information another source forming part of the resource itself, giving preference to sources in which the information is formally presented.

#### **2.2.2.4 Other Resources**

For a resource other than one covered under [2.2.2.2 RDA](#)—[2.2.2.3 RDA](#), use as the preferred source of information, as applicable:

***either***

- a) a label bearing a title that is permanently printed on or affixed to the resource, excluding accompanying textual material or a container (e.g., a label on an audio CD or a model), unless they present a collective title not found elsewhere in the resource.

***or***

- b) embedded metadata in textual form that contains a title (e.g., metadata embedded in an MP3 audio file).

If the resource does not contain a source of information falling into either category a) or b) above, use as the preferred source of information another source forming part of the resource itself, giving preference to sources in which the information is formally presented.

## APPENDIX Examples

- Example of single CD with no collective title, but with collective title on accompanying textual material:

Albany Records TROY755 (OCLC #61285903)

*On disc:*

JOHN BARNES CHANCE  
ILLINOIS STATE WIND SYMPHONY  
STEPHEN K. STEELE, CONDUCTOR

1. Incantation and Dance

*[Then follows a list of work and movement titles]*

JOHN BARNES CHANCE

*On cover of booklet and container spine:*

The legacy of John Barnes Chance  
*[responsibility statements for the performers]*

- Example of sound recording set where discs lack collective title, but container and accompanying textual material have a collective title:

Warner Classics 256462092-2 (OCLC #62301099)

*On discs and cardboard sleeves:*

Sonatas, KK 1-19

Sonatas, KK 20-30

*[this pattern continues for the remainder of the 34 discs in the set]*

*On clamshell container and cover of accompanying booklet, laid in clamshell box:*

SCARLATTI

The keyboard sonatas \* Scott Ross *[the performer]*

*On t.p. of accompanying booklet:*

DOMENICO SCARLATTI  
The complete keyboard sonatas  
Scott Ross