To: ALA/ALCTS/CC:DA Committee on Cataloging: Description and Access

From: Nathan Putnam, Chair, Task Force to Investigate the Instructions for Recording Relationships in RDA

Subject: Instructions for Recording Structured Descriptions of Related Manifestations

Progress Report (December 2014)

The Task Force has concentrated on providing instructions for structured descriptions of Related Manifestations (27.1). The following document provides some tentative instructions for the following relationships:

- Container of (Manifestation)
- Contained in (Manifestation)
- Reproduced as (Manifestation)
- Reproduction of (Manifestation)

It also includes some tentative general instructions for structured descriptions of related manifestations. For each relationship, some tentative instructions are given, along with some examples and some issues for discussion. The tentative instructions are given succinctly, and are not yet formally worded.

A separate document addresses the more complex issues surrounding the Accompanying Material relationship.

CONTAINER OF (MANIFESTATION)

Instructions:

Record the relationship designator *container of (manifestation)*.

For each part contained in the resource, record the title proper, by applying the instructions at **2.3.2**.

Record the statement of responsibility relating to the title proper for each part, applying the instructions at **2.4.2**.

Alternative
If the parts are by the same author, omit the statement of responsibility naming that author.

Record other elements of the manifestation (e.g., identifiers, extent) for each part, if considered important for identification or selection, applying the appropriate instructions for the elements in question.

Record elements of the work or expression (e.g., form of work, duration) for each part, if considered important for identification or selection, applying the appropriate instructions for the elements in question.

EXAMPLES

Container of (manifestation): Map of area with highlighted street. — NYDA.1933.010.00130
Container of (manifestation): View of Mill Brooks Houses from one of the houses, 89/05. — NYDA.1993.010.00131
Container of (manifestation): View SE from Mill Brook House on rooftop on Cypress Ave. between 136th St. and 137th St., 93/05. — NYDA.1933.010.00132
Container of (manifestation): View N from 136th St. rooftop of area between Bruckner Expressway and Cypress Ave., 93/06. — NYDA.1933.010.00133
Container of (manifestation): View E from rooftop of garden bounded by Bruckner Expressway, 136th St. and 135th St., 93/06. — NYDA.1933.010.00134
Resource described: 136th Street, southeastern section of the Bronx. Set of 11 slides

Container of (manifestation): v. 1. Status, distribution, and taxonomy (xvii, 848 pages : 1 map) — v. 2. Field guide (xvii, 740 pages, 96 leaves of plates : illustrations (some coloured), maps (1 coloured))
Resource described: The birds of Ecuador / by Robert S. Ridgely and Paul J. Greenfield ; with the collaboration of Mark B. Robbins and Paul Coopmans ; in association with the Academy of Natural Sciences. — Ithaca, NY : Comstock Publishing, 2001. **A two-volume set**

Container of (manifestation): Codo, de mi diario de campaña : en campaña 1 de febrero a 24 de agosto de 1937 / Antonio Conill y Mataró, Teniente Provisional de Infantería, Requeté del Tercio de Nuestra Señora de Montserrat. — Diario de campaña de un requeté : en campaña abril 1937-agosto 1939 / Rosendo Doménech Puig del laureado Tercio de Requetés de Nuestra Señora de Montserrat. — Diario de un requeté (manuscrito inédito) : Barcelona-Villalba de los Arcos, 1937-1938 / Luis Espoy y de Delás del laureado Tercio de Requetés de Nuestra Señora de Montserrat.
Resource described: a compilation of three diaries from the Spanish Civil War

Container of (manifestation): Horn sonata in F, Op. 17 / Ludwig van Beethoven ; Michel Garcin-Marrou, natural horn ; Melvyn Tan, fortepiano (14:36) — 4 Songs without works / Felix Mendelssohn-Bartholdy ; Melvyn Tan, fortepiano (9:10) — Introduction and variations on "Trockne Blumen", Op. 60/D802 / Franz Schubert ; Konrad Hünteler, flute ; Melvyn Tan, fortepiano (20:05) — 2 Songs without Works ; Rondo capriccioso, Op. 14 / Mendelssohn ; Melvyn Tan, fortepiano (11:49) — Grand duo concertant, Op. 48 (J.204) / Carl Maria von Weber ; Eric Hoeprich, clarinet ; Melvyn Tan, fortepiano (20:40)
Resource described: Salonkonzert / Beethoven, Schubert, Weber, Mendelssohn.

— Hayes, Middlesex, England : EMI records, ℗1990.

Recommendations and Discussion Issues:

1) The basic instructions currently in chapter 24 (and repeated in chapters 25-28) have a sentence that addresses the order of elements in the structured description. "Present the data in the order specified by a recognized display standard (e.g., ISBD presentation (see appendix D.))." The Task Force recommends that the instructions not prescribe the order of elements.

2) There is only one applicable relationship designator for this type of description (the "contained in" relationship for related manifestations). Some of us find the old designator "contains" to be preferable to the new designator "contained in" and we might wish to make that point in our proposal.

3) Two examples in the current 27.1 show (a) separate "notes" for each part, each preceded by the relationship designator, and (b) a single "note" for all the parts, preceded by the relationship designator. We recommend that RDA allow both conventions; therefore, the instruction relating to the relationship designator does not say to record it for each part.

4) The instructions refer to "each part [contained in the resource]". This instruction applies only to manifestation relationships in chapter 27, so this does not rule out recording the contents as work or expression relationships – the Task Force will deal with those possibilities in the context of chapters 25 and 26.

5) The term "part" here applies to parts that are clearly separate works (a compilation of three novels); to parts that are separate works, but may not be described as such (chapters by different authors in a Festschrift or similar compilation); and to parts of works what would almost never be treated as separate works (chapters of a single work). For the purposes of this chapter, these are probably equivalent because the construction of the structured description would be based on the same sources. However, the Task Force recommends that there should be a Glossary definition for this meaning of Part (the current definitions are for issue/part of a serial or other multipart resource and musical part).

6) It is difficult to imagine a contents note that does not include a list of titles; even a devised title is considered to be a title proper. Therefore, the instruction to record the title proper for each part is unconditional. If there is no title proper, one would need to use an unstructured description.

7) The statement of responsibility raises some issues about when it should be included. An earlier draft of this instruction said to record the statement if the parts were by different authors. However, it can be argued that the structured description would be more machine-actionable if the statement were always recorded. The Task Force recommends that the basic instruction be to record the statement of responsibility (without condition), with an alternative to omit the statement when all the parts are by the same author(s). Given that the instruction is to transcribe following 2.4.2, the statement presumably could not be repeated in the structured description if it were not repeated in the sources of information. The Task Force needs to consider this further; advice is welcome.

8) A resource (and its parts) may contain multiple statements of responsibility. Based on actions at the November 2014 JSC meeting, this has been expanded to include performers and technical credits formerly recorded in Chapter 7 elements. The instructions above deal with statements of responsibility generically, and do not explicitly address multiple statements for different roles. Are further instructions needed here?

9) Separate instructions are given to record elements of the manifestation and elements of the work or expression. Both instructions are conditional ("if considered important for identification or selection"). This recommendation is somewhat tentative. On the one hand, for practical reasons, it is often useful to include expression information (such as duration) in the contents note, and this makes sense so long as we are creating composite descriptions in MARC. On the other hand, it does seem to violate the WEMI model, and RDA looks forward to a scenario in which each entity will be described separately. Does a structured description that includes both manifestation and expression attributes make sense in such an environment? Further discussion is needed.

10) All of the instructions above say to record an element following the instructions for that element in chapters 2 and 3 (for manifestation-level contents notes). Should we consider breaking that principle, particularly in the case of work or expression attributes, and say to record the information as it appears on the manifestation? Does this compromise the machine-actionability (limited though it might be) of structured descriptions?

11) The Task Force believes that, most often, a description of each part that consists of information recorded from the manifestation will be the most useful way of creating and presenting the contents information. However, this is a recommended "best practice" and the instructions should allow for recording the contents of the work or the expression or the item. With the present lack of RDA application profiles, it would seem to be important for our proposal to address preferred practice, as well as the general range of what should be allowed. This is a good example: the "contained in" relationship can be recorded for any WEMI entity, but we are arguing that there are good reasons why recording it for the manifestation is the best practice – at least as long as we are encoding in MARC.

CONTAINED IN (MANIFESTATION)

Instructions:

Record the relationship designator *contained in (manifestation).*

Record the title proper of the host resource, by applying the instructions at **2.3.2**.

Record other elements of the manifestation (e.g., statement of responsibility, publication statement, extent), if considered important for identification or selection, applying the appropriate instructions for the elements in question.

Record elements of the work or expression (e.g., form of work, content type), if considered important for identification or selection, applying the appropriate instructions for the elements in question.

EXAMPLES

Contained in (manifestation): Understanding our environment / NSTA. — Arlington, VA : National Science Teachers Association, [1995]
Resource described: The Earth's fractured surface ; Living on the edge : [West Coast of U.S.] / produced by the Cartographic Division, National Geographic Society ; John F. Shupe, chief cartographer. — Washington, D.C. : National Geographic Society, 1995. **Two maps on one sheet**

Contained in (manifestation): While mortals sleep / Kurt Vonnegut. Spoken word.
Resource described: Jenny : from the collection While mortals sleep / by Kurt Vonnegut. -- Prince Frederick, MD : Recorded Books, [2011]. **An audio disc.**

Recommendations and Discussion Issues:

1) There is only one applicable relationship designator for this type of description.

2) Again, the title proper seems to be the primary and (almost) indispensable element.

3) In this case, other elements would be conditional "if considered important for identification or selection".

REPRODUCED AS (MANIFESTATION)

Instructions:

Record an appropriate relationship designator (see **J.4.2**).

Record the title proper of the related resource, by applying the instructions at **2.3.2**.

Record the publication statement of the related resource, by applying the instructions at **2.8**.

Record other elements of the manifestation if considered important for identification or selection, applying the appropriate instructions for the elements in question.

EXAMPLES

Facsimile of (manifestation): A classification and subject index for cataloguing and arranging the books and pamphlets of a library. — Amherst, Mass. : Melvil Dewey, 1876 (Hartford, Conn. : Printed by the Case, Lockwood & Brainard Company, [1876]
Resource described: Dewey decimal classification : centennial 1876–1876, — [Lake Placid?, New York] : Forest Press Division, Lake Placid Education Foundation, [1987]

Electronic reproduction (manifestation): Boulder, Colorado : NetLibrary, 2007. — Available via World Wide Web. Access may be limited to NetLibrary affiliated libraries. — http://www.netLibrary.com/urlapi.asp?action=sumary&v=1&bookid=186297
Partial description of the equivalent manifestation

Reproduced as (manifestation): Lacey, WA : OCLC Preservation Service Center on behalf of University of Washington Libraries, 2005. — 1 microfilm reel ; 10 cm, 35 mm. — On reel with other titles
Partial description of the equivalent manifestation

Recommendations and Discussion Issues:

1) The appropriate relationship designators here consist of a term and a number of narrower designators. The instructions might include something about choosing the most specific applicable designator applicable to the resource.

2) The title proper is again given as an essential element, although this might not be informative when it is identical to the title proper of the resource being described. However, PCC instructions say always to record the title.

3) Because these are related manifestations, the publication statement is included here in order to differentiate the two resources. However, the PCC instructions do not require this.

4) Other elements are considered optional.

5) The examples are taken from the current text of RDA 27.1.

REPRODUCTION OF (MANIFESTATION)

Instructions:

Record an appropriate relationship designator (see **J.4.2**).

Record the title proper of the related resource, by applying the instructions at **2.3.2**.

Record the publication statement of the related resource, by applying the instructions at **2.8**.

Record other elements of the manifestation if considered important for identification or selection, applying the appropriate instructions for the elements in question.

EXAMPLES

Reprint of (manifestation): La América Latina del siglo XXI. Buenos Aires : Edhasa, 2006. With a new prologue, introduction and epilogue.
Resource described: [need new title, imprint]

Electronic reproduction (manifestation): Dicionario das artes visuais na Paraíba 2010. [João Pessoa, Paraíba, Brazil] : Linha D'Água, [2010?]. 1 CD-ROM.

Recommendations and Discussion Issues: See the issues listed for the previous relationship.

GENERAL INSTRUCTIONS FOR STRUCTURED DESCRIPTIONS OF RELATED MANIFESTATIONS

Instructions:

Record an appropriate relationship designator (see **J.4**). If none of the terms listed in Appendix J is appropriate or sufficiently specific, use another concise term to indicate the nature of the relationship.

Describe the related manifestation by recording elements of the manifestation that are considered important for identification or selection, applying the appropriate instructions for the elements in question.

> *Optional addition*
> Record elements of the work or expression if considered important for identification or selection, applying the appropriate instructions for the elements in question.

Recommendations and Discussion Issues:

1) These instructions are a generalized version of the specific instructions in this draft. Although some of the specific instructions have additions or variations, these may be the only general instructions needed.

2) The Task Force might recommend that the title proper of the related resource should always be included. We did say that for the whole/part relationships, and might say that for the equivalent (reproduction) relationships, but it does not make sense for the accompanying material relationship, so it seemed premature to include in the general instructions.

3) Several of our instructions allowed elements from the work or expression to be included in the structured description of a manifestation. These not labeled as optional additions, but we might consider doing so.