To: ALA/ALCTS/CC:DA Committee on Cataloging: Description and Access

From: Nathan Putnam, Chair, Task Force to Investigate the Instructions for Recording Relationships in RDA

Subject: Instructions for Describing Accompanying Material in RDA

Background

The Task Force to Investigate the Instructions for Recording Relationships in RDA has been concentrating on instructions for various sorts of Related Manifestations (see CC:DA/TF/Instructions for Recording Relationships/6). In considering the instructions for recording the Accompanied By (Manifestation) relationship, we encountered a number of issues relating to (a) the definition of these relationships in J.4.5, and (b) the instructions in chapters 1 and 3 that deal with describing resources consisting of more than one physical carrier. The following document records the Task Force's discussion of these various issues and our recommendations.

Definition of accompanying material

The *accompanied by (manifestation)* relationship is defined in J.4.5, along with several subordinate relationships:

> **accompanied by (manifestation)** A manifestation issued with another manifestation, without any relationship to its content. *Reciprocal relationship:* accompanied by (manifestation)
>
>> **issued with** A manifestation that is issued on the same carrier as the manifestation being described. *Reciprocal relationship:* issued with
>>
>>> **filmed with (manifestation)** A manifestation that is issued on the same microform with the manifestation being described. *Reciprocal relationship:* filmed with (manifestation)
>>>
>>> **on disc with (manifestation)** A manifestation that is issued on the same disc with the manifestation being described. *Reciprocal relationship:* on disc with (manifestation)

Some comments on these definitions:

- The meaning of "without any relationship to its content" in the first definition is not clear, but it seems to mean that an accompanying relationship does not depend on there being a relationship between the content of the resources. Most often, there is a relationship (and this relationship is a distinct relationship such as **Augmentation of**), that there does not have to be any content relationship.

- *Accompanied by* is defined very broadly, with "issued with" as a narrower term.

- *Issued with* relationships are between resources on the *same* carrier. The *accompanying material* relationship that we have been working on exist between resources on *different*, physically separate, carriers. It is not clear that this is the same as the *accompanied by* relationship defined here.

See Addendum 1 below for the Appendix J designators and their definitions.

The Task Force has been working on the *accompanying material* relationship as it is defined as an element in ISBD Area 5. This relationship exists between two physically-separate components of the resource. Further, accompanying material only exists when one of the physical components of the resource has been declared to be predominant; in that case, the other physical components can be treated as accompanying material. The implications of that will be discussed in the next section.

The Task Force agreed that **the thing that is currently missing from RDA is the ability to designate one or more carrier(s) as predominant.** RDA 3.1.4.1 (see below) allows for separate extent statements for each carrier, but does not allow for one or more of these extent statements to be designated as predominant.

The Task Force was not completely in agreement about the nature of the *accompanying material* relationship. For some, this relationship exists purely between carriers. There may be a thematic connection between the content of the predominant component and the content of the accompanying material, but that is a separate relationship (e.g., *Augmentation of*). For others, the thematic connection is a critical factor in designating the predominant component, and is therefore a part of the nature of the accompanying relationship. **Further discussion on this issue is needed.**

Given all of this, it is not clear that the *accompanying material* relationship we have been working on is in fact the same as the *accompanied by* relationship defined in J.4.5. The Task Force needs to decide whether to clarify the *accompanied by* relationship and/or to add a separate *accompanying material* relationship — and decide where this belongs in J.4.5. **Further discussion on this issue is needed.**

Some context for the accompanying material relationship

The context for an accompanying material relationship in RDA begins with guidelines in **1.5.2** on how to deal with resources that have more than one part:

> When using a comprehensive description for a resource that has more than one part, record details about the parts of the resource in any of the following ways that are applicable:
>
> a) as part of the description of the carrier (see **3.1.4**)
>
> b) as a relationship to a related work (see **25.1**)
>
> c) as a relationship to a related manifestation (see **27.1**)

For describing multipart resources *as part of the description of the* carrier, **1.5.2** refers us to **3.1.4**. At **3.1.4**, there are additional instructions about recording information about physical parts as part of the carrier description:

When preparing a comprehensive description for a resource consisting of more than one carrier type, apply the method that is appropriate to the nature of the resource and the purpose of the description:

1) record only carrier type and extent of each carrier (see **3.1.4.1**)
   or
2) record carrier type, extent, and other characteristics of each carrier (see **3.1.4.2**)
   or
3) record the predominant carrier type and extent in general terms (see **3.1.4.3**).

Record additional characteristics of particular carriers if considered important for identification or selection (see **3.6**–**3.20**).

Note, however, that there is a major disjunction between **1.5.2** and **3.1.4**. The former covers all resources in more than one part, and refers to **3.1.4** for describing them "as part of the description of the carrier". However, **3.1.4** is limited to "Resources of more than one carrier type". There is nothing in **3.1.4** that covers resources with parts of the same carrier type, such as a book with a physically separate supplement or index, or a book accompanied by a volume of maps or illustrations. One would assume that this was considered to be obvious: the single content type would be recorded, and the extent of the resource would be recorded by applying **3.4.1.3**. In other words, the accompanying material would simply be treated as an additional volume in the extent statement.

The problems with this are: (a) there is no direct path from **1.5.2** to **3.4.1.3**; and (b) the instructions for recording extent do not now allow for one component to be treated as predominant and the other(s) as accompanying material – which is the whole point of the current exercise. So there may need to be some revision to **1.5.2** and/or **3.1.4** and/or **3.4.1**, if we wish to support this accompanying material concept.

Let's return to **3.1.4** and see how the ISBD concept of accompanying material might fit into the instructions – assuming that they were not limited to resources on more than one carrier type.

3.1.4 c introduces the concept of a predominant part, which seems to be a critical aspect of the concept of accompanying material: when you treat one part as predominant, you can then treat the other part(s) as accompanying material.

Currently **3.1.4.3** contains instructions to record the predominant carrier type and an extent statement that applies to the resource as a whole. This does not currently allow the non-predominant parts to be described as accompanying material. This is perhaps the first thing we need to address. If we wish to support the ISBD concept of accompanying material, **3.1.4.3** needs to allow (either as the main instruction or an alternative) the recording of (1) the extent of the predominant part in the Extent element, and (2) the extent of the accompanying material as a structured description of the accompanying manifestation.

The Task Force makes the following tentative recommendations:

1. RDA 3.4.1 should be revised so that it covers resources of multiple carriers, whether of the same type or of different types.

2. Further, RDA 3.1.4 could also be revised to deal with additional elements and to simplify the structure. See Addendum 2 for options for modifying 3.1.4.

3. The concepts of predominant and accompanying carriers need to be introduced into RDA, probably in 3.1.4.1.

4. The use of a structured description in Chapter 27 is an appropriate way of describing accompanying material. It is not yet clear whether this should be done (a) by introducing the concepts directly into 3.1.4.1, and/or (b) by including instructions in 27.1. The Task Force believes that the latter will be necessary in either case. A simplified version of the instructions on recording a structured description of accompanying material, based on the 2013 strawman proposal is given in Addendum 3.

EXAMPLES of accompanying material

To assist this discussion, Melanie compiled a list of examples and categorized them in terms of the carrier and content connections:

- Textbook with accompanying student textbook
    - physically separate
    - same type of carrier
    - thematic connection
    - augmentation of Work in principal carrier
- Book with accompanying volume of illustrations
    - physically separate
    - same type of carrier
    - thematic connection
    - augmentation of Work in principal carrier
- Book with CD-ROM that contains copy of Book
    - physically separate
    - different type of carrier
    - thematic connection (or equivalent resource?)
    - electronic reproduction/different expression of Work in principal carrier
- Book with CD-ROM that contains copy of Book and MORE
    - physically separate
    - different type of carrier
    - thematic connection
    - electronic reproduction/different expression of Work in principal carrier AND augmentation of Work in principal carrier
- Book with CD-ROM that contains sound records that are mentioned in the book
    - Physically separate
    - Different type of carrier
    - thematic connection
    - Augmentation of Work in principal carrier
- Book with illustrations in a pocket at the back of the book
    - Physically separate
    - Different type of carrier (volume vs. sheet)
    - thematic connection
    - augmentation of Work in principal carrier
- Children's book with toy tied (temporarily) to the book
    - physically separate
    - different type of carrier (volume vs. other)
    - thematic connection
    - augmentation of work in principal carrier
- Book with links to website (website includes discussion forum, or video tutorials, or, etc.)
    - physically separate
    - different type of carrier (volume vs. online)
    - thematic connection
    - augmentation of work

- Score with parts
  - physically separate (usually; may be a hybrid: parts in pocket)
  - same type of carrier (volume)
  - thematic connection (same work)
  - different components of work (different format of notated music)
- Compact disc (audiorecording) with a booklet (which usually includes a copy of the libretto/lyrics)
  - physically separate (usually a hybrid: booklet in CD case)
  - different type of carrier (volume vs. audiodisc)
  - thematic connection (same work(s))
  - augmentation (notes) or language expressions (libretto/lyrics).

Addendum 1: Appendix J definitions

J.2.5: includes only *augmentation of (work), augmented by (work),* and *complemented by (work)* relationships; it does not include *accompanied by* relationships.

J.3.5: includes only *augmentation of (expression), augmented by (expression),* and *complemented by (expression)* relationships; it does not include *accompanied by* relationships.

J.4.5

accompanied by (manifestation) A manifestation issued with another manifestation~~, without any relationship to its content~~. *Reciprocal relationship:* accompanied by (manifestation)

>*issued with* A manifestation that is issued on the same carrier as the manifestation being described. *Reciprocal relationship:* issued with

>>*filmed with (manifestation)* A manifestation that is issued on the same microform with the manifestation being described. *Reciprocal relationship:* filmed with (manifestation)

>>*on disc with (manifestation)* A manifestation that is issued on the same disc with the manifestation being described. *Reciprocal relationship:* on disc with (manifestation)

J.5.5

accompanied by (item) An item brought together with another item after being issued. *Reciprocal relationship:* accompanied by (item)

>*bound with* An item that has been bound within the same binding as the item being described. *Reciprocal relationship:* bound with

>*filmed with (item)* An item that is contained on the same microform with the item being described. *Reciprocal relationship:* filmed with (item)

>*on disc with (item)* An item that is contained on the same disc with the item being described. *Reciprocal relationship:* on disc with (item)

Addendum 2: Restructuring of 3.1.4

The first change needed is to match the scope of 3.1.4 with the scope of 1.5.2 a) which refers to 3.1.4:

3.1.4 Resources Consisting of More Than One Carrier ~~Type~~

When preparing a comprehensive description for a resource consisting of more than one carrier ~~type~~, apply the method that is appropriate to the nature of the resource and the purpose of the description:

Resources consisting of more than one physical carrier may need multiple instances of these elements:

- Media Type (3.2) [not current included in 3.1.4]
- Carrier Type (3.3)
- Extent (3.4)
- Additional characteristics (3.5–3.20) [Currently 3.6–3.20; why are Dimensions excluded?]

The instructions are currently organized by three categories, based on the actions to be taken:

- Record only carrier type and extent of each carrier
- Record carrier type, extent and other characteristics of each carrier
- Record predominant carrier type and extent in general terms.

These categories do not currently cover the case in which there are multiple carriers of the same type (this is the change in scope proposed above). Furthermore, the first category does not allow the cataloger to distinguish between predominant and accompanying carriers; and the third category does not allow for recording extent of predominant and accompanying carriers separately (these two ways of introducing the concept of accompanying material).

Accommodating both the additional elements and the expanded action categories in the current structure could be quite complicated. Therefore, I suggest the possibility of restructuring 3.1.4 to give separate instructions for each element. Many of these will turn out to be rather simple, the exception being the recording of the extent statement. What follows is more a decision tree than it is a proposal for wording the instructions.

3.1.4 Resources Consisting of More Than One Carrier

3.1.4.1 Media Type

When the carriers are of different media types, record each media type (see 3.2.1.3).

Alternative
Record only the media type of the predominant carrier.

When the carriers are of the same media type, record that media type (see 3.2.1.3).

3.1.4.2 Carrier Type

When the carriers are of different carrier types, record each carrier type (see 3.3.1.3).

Alternative
Record only the type of the predominant carrier.

When the carriers are of the same carrier type, record that carrier type (see 3.3.1.3).

3.1.4.3 Extent

Record the extent of each carrier (see 3.4.1.3)

Optional addition
If the carriers are in a container, record the extent by naming the container.

Alternative
If one or more carriers are predominant, record the extent of the predominant carrier.

Record the extent of accompanying carriers as a structured or unstructured description of the accompanying material (see 27.???).

3.1.4.4 Other Characteristics

Record other characteristics of each carrier, if considered important for identification or selection.

Another way to accomplish the "alternative" at 3.1.4.3 above is to follow the main instructions (record the extent of each carrier) and to add to each a sub-element that identifies whether the statement applies to a predominant carrier or an accompanying carrier. I'm not at all sure what this might look like, so I have not attempted to suggest any text.

Addendum 3: Draft Instructions for Recording
a Structured Description of Accompanying Material

In order to provide context for this discussion, here is a simplified version of the instructions for recording a structured description of accompanying material — if we decide to pursue that approach. The text is basically that included in the strawman proposal.

Instructions:

Record the relationship designator *accompanied by (manifestation)* (see appendix **J.4.5**).

Record the extent of the accompanying material (see **3.4.1.3**).

Record additional elements (e.g., number of subunits (see **3.4.1.7**), dimensions (see **3.5**), if considered important for identification or selection.

> *Accompanied by (manifestation):* 1 volume (12 pages : illustrations ; 18 cm)

> *Accompanied by (manifestation):* 1 atlas (95 pages : 85 colour maps ; 32 cm)

Alternative
In the extent statement, record a word or phrase indicating the nature of the accompanying material. Record additional elements, if considered important for identification.

> *Accompanied by (manifestation):* 1 guide

> *Accompanied by (manifestation):* 1 libretto

> *Accompanied by (manifestation):* 1 teacher's edition